

Assessment of In-Text Citations and Referencing Styles Adopted in Theses Submitted to University of Ilorin Postgraduate School between 2010 and 2016

TundeShamsudeen AJIBOLA ¹; AbdulwahabOlanrewaju ISSA ²

Department of Library and Information Science, Faculty of Communication and Information Sciences, University of Ilorin, Ilorin, Nigeria^{1,2}

ABSTRACT

This study assessed in-text citations and referencing styles adopted in theses submitted to the University of Ilorin Postgraduate School between 2010 and 2016. The objectives of the study were to: identify the number of theses submitted to the University of Ilorin Postgraduate School according to the faculties and departments; assess the departmental, faculty and postgraduate school requirements for the submission of doctoral theses; identify the predominant in-text citations and referencing styles adopted in the submitted theses; examine the accuracy in the use of in-text citations and referencing styles adopted; ascertain the consistency in the use of in-text citations and referencing styles adopted; and assess the uniformity in the use of in-text citations and referencing style formats adopted. The study adopted citation analysis design of the qualitative method. Purposive sampling was used to select 255 Ph.D. theses out of 683 doctoral theses from 12 faculties and over 50 departments offering postgraduate programmes in the institution. The document review, checklist, personal observation and interview were the data collection instruments. Six research questions were answered using qualitative content analysis. The findings revealed that Faculty of Education had the highest number of Ph.D. theses (203) submitted during the period. There were variations in the referencing methods used in the theses. However, APA was the most predominantly used citation formats, though with errors, inaccuracies and inconsistencies in the reference citations, which were found to have improved in correctness and appropriateness in both the in-text citations and reference since 2015. Also, there was lack of uniformity in the referencing styles adopted. The study concluded that there was a low quality in-text citations and referencing and lack of uniformity in the presentations in the submitted theses. It therefore recommended the issuance of the University of Ilorin Manual of Styles to provide guides for writing theses and dissertations, employing all strategies for enforcing compliance.

Keywords: In-text Citations, Referencing Styles, Ph.D. theses, University of Ilorin Postgraduate School, Nigeria

INTRODUCTION

Universities, all over the world, are recognized as institutions established for the advancement of knowledge, research, teaching and learning, scholarship, innovation and making a sound judgement. Postgraduate programmes are considered conduits through which universities develop research capacity and generate the high-end skills required for a functional economy and to address complex issues ranging from global financial recession, climate change, to poverty alleviation and combating terrorism (Mutula, 2009). Research in postgraduate studies takes different forms but generally requires those admitted to such programmes to have completed a bachelor degree or a diploma. Postgraduate qualifications may be classified into traditional, academic and professional degrees. Traditional postgraduate qualifications tend to be generic, while professional ones reflect a deeper understanding of a discipline (PG Research, 2009).

In Nigeria and the University of Ilorin in particular, admissions to Ph.D. programmes demand a Master degree with an average weighted score of at least 60% or Master of Philosophy (M.Phil. /Ph.D.) in a given field. In addition, candidates have to appear for an interview to be conducted by the department. Final admission depends on the outcome of the interview. Moreso, the duration of a given postgraduate programme varies from one institution to others, even within the same country, and from one discipline to another. The net product of a Ph.D. is a theses that has to be assessed by independent experts in the discipline. Some institutions also insist that the theses be defended in an oral examination, where candidates present their research before a panel of examiners.

Generally, postgraduate research is not intended to yield groundbreaking results, discovery or innovation (Mutula, 2009). Thus, the theses writing process is actually an apprenticeship for mastering systematic research processes. Ticinch (2006) submits that the objective of postgraduate research is not to make breakthrough inventions or major scientific discoveries; rather it is a mechanism by which graduate students learn how to undertake a systematic investigation based on work done by peers in the field, and then to extend or add to the current state of knowledge. It should, however, be stated that more emphasis is usually placed on systematic investigation than on the degree to which knowledge is enhanced. In all academic writings like assignments, projects, research articles, reports, dissertations and theses, the practice is to give an overview of the current knowledge about a topic and to provide evidence to support the points that a researcher makes. These ideas will form the basis for one's own arguments and will be incorporated into one's own work by:

- i. quoting (using the exact words of another);
- ii. paraphrasing (using the ideas of another in your own words);
- iii. summarizing (using the main points of another); and
- iv. translating the original text and summarizing or paraphrasing it (Lampthey & Atta-Obeng, 2012).

Acknowledging other people's ideas, opinions or viewpoints in one's work is an important attribute of academic work. This type of acknowledgement is variously known as referencing, documentation, or citation style or system. A referencing style is a set of rules and formats that specify how to reference different types of sources, e.g. books, journal articles, web pages, and other Internet-based resources. There styles vary from discipline to discipline. Although their origin is obscure, modern reference style formats are associated with the information explosion of the 1980s and 90s that witnessed a rapid increase in scholarly publications, compelling writers and publishers to find convenient methods to reference the different sources they consulted in their publications (Krummel, 2002).

Assessment of In -Text Citations and Referencing Styles Adopted in Theses Submitted to University of Ilorin Postgraduate School between 2010 and 2016

These referencing methods are used in different fields and for specific purposes including the Harvard, American Psychological Association (APA), Modern Language Association (MLA), and Turabian (Chicago). Turabian has two versions, namely, Chicago/Turabian Notes, often used by History and Humanity disciplines and Chicago/Turabian Author-Date often used for the Physical, Natural and Social Sciences, Vancouver, Council of Science Editors (CSE), and American Sociological Association (ASA). Other such systems are Modern Humanities Research Association (MHRA), Oxford Standard for the Citation of Legal Authorities (OSCOLA) and Oxford referencing styles. However, the focus of this study is on the most used and current formats and styles of referencing namely: Harvard, APA, MLA, Chicago/Turabian, CSE, and Vancouver.

Citing references is essential in academia. It gives credit where it is due, adds authority to a statement and shows that a writer is not just giving his/her views or opinions but also including those of other writers. It also illustrates a point or offers support for an argument a writer wants to make and enables readers of a work to find the source material (Damarell, Badcock & Miller, 2005). Also, a citation is a way of giving credit to individuals for their works that a researcher has been utilized to support his research. It can also be used to locate particular sources and combat plagiarism. Typically, a citation can include the author's name, date, and location of the publishing company, journal title, or DOI (Digital Object Identifier). Coleman (2005) asserted that citations acknowledge the existence of related literature. Citation shows that a relationship exists between the work of an author and the previous works done in that field. Merton (as cited in Olatokun & Makinde, 2009) stated that Isaac Newton referred to this relationship when he said, "If I have seen further, it is by standing on the shoulders of giants". References need to be cited where documents are referred to in the text or a work. Accuracy and consistency are essential to enable readers to identify and locate the materials referred to (Flinders University, 2002).

STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM

Postgraduate theses and dissertations are grey literature that contain very vital information and serve as important and useful tools in research activities. They are literature, which engage in critical philosophical reflection and make contributions to the existing body of knowledge. Swain (2010) noted that postgraduate theses and dissertations are the windows to high-level research carried out in the university; as they are likely to contain information of reasonable quality. However, there have been some general concerns from higher education stakeholders, including external examiners and education quality assurance officers, on the quality of theses and dissertations written and submitted by postgraduate students. Most of such concerns have suggested that the quality of the research reports is low (Wang & Li, 2008; Bitchener & Basturkmen, 2006; Holbrook et al., 2004; Lessing & Schulze, 2003).

Significant contributors to this low quality incident are inaccuracies detected, which included works cited in the text that was not reflected in the references at the end of the theses and those not cited in the text that were added to the references. There are also errors in reference citations on theses written by doctoral students, examples of which are poor citing of reference works, inconsistency in reference citations and use of different citation styles in theses from the same department. Non-adherence to standard rules for punctuation, spellings, and capitalization, where necessary, are other shortfalls in in-text citations and the references (Lampthey & Atta-Obeng, 2012).

Yet, most of the studies on citation analysis focused on sources of information cited or consulted (Anunobi, Okoye, & Chima, 2011; Echezona; Somashekara & Kumbar, 2015), authorship pattern (Borthakur, 2015; Devi & Das, 2016), list of core or ranked journals used (Anunobi, Okoye, & Chima, 2012; Olatokun & Makinde, 2009), obsolescence of literature (Devi & Das, 2016; Olatokun & Makinde, 2009), distribution of citations by subject (Devis & Das, 2016; Somashekara & Kumbar, 2015), and country of origin and language (Singh & Bebi, 2013).

However, only a few studies have been conducted on in-text citations and referencing style formats adopted in dissertations and theses written by postgraduate students (Lamprey & Atta-Obeng, 2012; Yusuf, 2016). Not many institutions in Nigeria have standardized formats, strictly enforced for compliance, which in turn improves the standard of presentation of these dissertations and theses. Owing to the significance attached to proper in-text citations and referencing in academic writings, absence of standard formats of presentation of dissertations and theses, particularly by the doctoral students in universities, certainly raises some research concerns. Thus, this study sets to assess in-text citations and referencing style formats adopted in Ph.D. theses submitted to the University of Ilorin Postgraduate School, covering the period 2010-2016.

RESEARCH QUESTIONS

This study answered the following research questions:

1. How many doctoral theses are submitted to the University of Ilorin Postgraduate School according to the faculties and departments during the period 2010-2016?
2. What are the departmental, faculty and postgraduate school requirements for the submission of doctoral theses during this period?
3. Which in-text citations and referencing styles adopted were predominant in the submitted theses during the period?
4. What is the level of accuracy in the use of in-text citations and referencing styles adopted in the submitted theses?
5. What is the extent to which the adopted in-text citations and referencing styles were consistent with the submitted theses?
6. What is the level of uniformity in the use of in-text citations and referencing style formats adopted in the submitted theses?

STUDY JUSTIFICATION

The overriding justification for a study of this nature lies in the fact that at the centre of any standard and qualitative theses, dissertation thesis or any other academic writings for that matter are the ethical issue of integrity as espoused by the need to avoid plagiarism like a plague. This unethical circumstance is easier and better avoided from the position of a good appreciation and understanding of in-text citations and referencing styles, which this study's findings set to reveal. The University of Ilorin Postgraduate School, postgraduate programmes' coordinators, supervisors, other academic staff and librarians at the University of Ilorin Library, could explore the findings of the study towards a concerted effort aimed at improving the overall quality of the these submitted by the Ph.D. students of the university.

REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE

Universities in different countries of the world have specific names given to the final research outputs of their graduating students. Amadasu (2010) noted that a common practice in Nigerian institutions of higher learning is that in which research works produced for the award of first degrees are called projects while those written in partial fulfilment for the award of postgraduate degrees are known as theses. Ifidon (2006) stressed that theses are works in fulfilment for the awards of master and doctorate degrees. Graduating students at all levels are mandated to carry out research in their areas of study in partial fulfilment for the award of various degrees. A copy of each submitted theses is usually deposited in the university library.

The research report is expected to indicate that the student has demonstrated a mastery of the subject area that has been researched (Komba, 2016). According to Helm (as cited in Lessing & Schulze, 2003), “postgraduate researches pose three problem areas, namely the research design, the data collecting and processing and the report writing” (p. 159). The writing phase of the research report (dissertation or thesis), poses a lot of challenges to students, as attested to by Andrews (2007) wrote that “to the vast majority of students, the dissertation is by far the most challenging piece of academic work” (p. 30). One of the requirements for completing the postgraduate studies is writing a dissertation or thesis.

Universities generally regard dissertations or theses as a professional document which conforms to the standards of scholarly writing and follow the guidelines set forth by the institutions. Doctoral papers are expected to reflect the results of original and significant research written in a scholarly and literate manner worthy of publication. Scholarly writing expectations include organization of ideas and materials, citation style, correct usage, sentence structure, spelling, and punctuation. The need to develop a plan when undertaking the dissertations or theses process is a common theme in the literature. Sharp and Howard (as cited in Armitage, 2006) emphasized the importance of planning when embarking on the supervision journey: “research supervision of postgraduate taught Master programmes should resist the temptation to proceed with its execution until an acceptable plan has been formulated, and that in large part, avoidable problems should be highlighted by the systematic planning process” (p. 159).

Andrews (2007) noted that despite the tacit or explicit requirement that a dissertation or thesis demonstrates, a student’s ability to develop an argument, evaluate and take a critical approach to knowledge, most research courses do not provide this kind of training; especially the mismatch between training and supervisor expectations of students’ capabilities. Thus, the postgraduate students are responsible for the format, style, and appearance of their theses or dissertations, subject to certain minimum university rules, and any requirements imposed by the particular degree programme. Therefore, a thesis or dissertation consists of four major parts namely: preliminary pages, text, references/ bibliography, and appendixes. The first rule of academic writing is “intellectual honesty”. The students are expected to be honest, and forthright in their academic endeavours. Proper attribution of the work of others is expected. To falsify the results of one’s research or other findings with the intent to deceive (fabrication) or to steal the words or ideas of another as if they are one’s own work (plagiarism) violates this rule. Writing in a discipline requires a complete, active, struggling engagement with the facts and principles of a discipline Rose (as cited in Singh, 2015).

Therefore, when submitting written work, it is essential for any source used in its preparation to be accurately cited. A clear and consistent style is needed to ensure that those reading the work can find the source you have quoted to follow up your arguments, or to verify quotations. Citations make one’s writing more persuasive as they are not used only to avoid plagiarism. By citing the work of a particular author, you acknowledge and respect the intellectual property rights of that researcher (Lamprey & Atta-Obeng, 2012). Researchers are therefore free to use millions of ideas, insights, and arguments published by other authors or writers. According to Hart (2005), the citations map the space of your discipline and allow you to navigate your way through your chosen field of study. In academic communities, ethics of research demand that writers be credited for their work and their writing. Not to do so is to plagiarize, intentionally or unintentionally appropriating ideas, languages and works of another without acknowledgement.

Neville (2007) defined referencing as the process of acknowledging one’s sources including anything taken information from books, journals, magazines, newspapers, websites, lecture notes, legislations, maps, television and

radio programmes, work of arts and dramatic performances. Failure to reference correctly or worse still not to reference at all is tantamount to plagiarism; a serious academic offence attracting disciplinary actions.

STYLES OF REFERENCING

Different referencing styles, systems or methods are used in different fields and for specific purposes. These include the Harvard, American Psychological Association (APA), Modern Language Association (MLA), and Turabian, which has two versions, namely, Chicago/Turabian Notes, often used by History and Humanity disciplines and Chicago/Turabian Author-Date often used by the Physical, Natural and Social Sciences, Vancouver, and Council of Science Editors. The Harvard system uses “Author-Date” style where two kinds of citations are needed. These are in-text citations and bibliographic (reference list) citations, where the ‘in-text’ occurs in the text of an article, while the ‘bibliographic’ citations are the compiled reference list.

Like other documentation systems, APA style provides a standard system, which gives credit to others for their contributions to work and it is widely accepted in the social sciences including business, education, and nursing. It is known as a “parenthetical” referencing style, meaning that citations to original sources appear in the texts. This allows the readers to see immediately where researchers’ information was found, thus making footnotes/endnotes unnecessary.

The MLA style is widely used in the humanities, especially in writing on language and literature. It features brief parenthetical citations in the text keyed to an alphabetical list of works cited appearing at the end of the work (Modern Language Association [MLA], 2016). It uses in-text citations rather than footnotes or endnotes, which are usually very brief, including the author's family name and a relevant page number. These citations correspond to the full references in the list of works cited at the end of the article. However, according to the “Handbook of Modern Language Association” of the 8th edition published in 2016, several significant changes have been effected to the MLA style, where with in-text citations, the researcher acknowledges a source by providing a brief reference to exactly where in the source he found the information. The reader can then use the complete reference listed in the *Works Cited* page at the end of the paper to verify what the researcher has written.

Chicago is a style that has been published by the Chicago University Press since 1906, which incorporates rules of grammar and punctuation common in American English. Typically, it has two basic components namely: *Notes and Bibliography* and *Author-Date*. Choosing between the two often depends on subject matter and the nature of sources cited, as each system is favoured by different groups of scholars. The first is preferred by many in the humanities, presenting bibliographic information in notes and, often, a bibliography. It accommodates a variety of sources, including esoteric ones less appropriate to the author-date system. However, the *Author-Date* system has long been used by those in the physical, natural, and social sciences, where sources are briefly cited in the text, usually in parentheses, by author’s last name and date of publication. The short citations are amplified in a list of references, where full bibliographic information is provided. Aside from the use of notes versus parenthetical references in the text, the two systems share a similar style with only slight differences. In the Turabian style, note numbers are superscript (¹) and number citations sequentially. Superscript is typed after punctuation except the dash, leave no space. In Chicago, however, regular numbers followed by a period and space (1.) are preferred. Also, single space footnotes with a blank line between each entry are used.

Assessment of In -Text Citations and Referencing Styles Adopted in Theses Submitted to University of Ilorin Postgraduate School between 2010 and 2016

In bibliographies, entries must be in alphabetical order by author's last name; single space entries with hanging tabs; include a blank line between entries; and if there is more than one author, only the first name is inverted. Place a period at the end of each main entry. In Author-Date parenthetical citation and reference list style, most of the rules for notes and bibliographies also apply using this system. Instead of footnotes or endnotes, provide the page(s) quoted or referred to in brief parenthetical references based on the author's last name and date of publication. After the body of the paper, the researcher must also provide an alphabetized reference list.

The Council of Science Editors (CSE), formerly the Council of Biology Editors, agree upon a particular scientific style and format. This style is used primarily in the medical sciences but also encompasses all scientific disciplines. There are three documentation systems for CSE namely: Name-Year(N-Y) system, Citation-Sequence(C-S) system, and Citation-Name(C-N) system. The N-Y format is referred to in the body of the paper using the in-text style. The in-text method for citations includes the author's name and the year of publication within parentheses and the citations are listed alphabetically by the author's surname in the end references page or reference list. This system is very similar to APA style. In the C-S system, each source is given a number, which is placed in the text using one of the following options: (1), [1], or ¹. Anytime the source is referred to again, the text is marked with the same number. At the end of the paper, a list of references provides full publication information for each numbered source. Entries in the reference list are numbered in the order in which they are mentioned in the paper. For CSE citation-sequence, the researcher must ensure consistency with the choice of option.

In the C-N style, each reference is given a number, which is placed in the text using one of the following options: (1), [1], or ¹. These numbers correspond to the article's location in an alphabetically organized reference list. In other words, the reference list is alphabetized and then numbered. These numbers are used in the text to cite the sources from the list. In this, the writer should ensure consistency with the choice of numbering style. The Vancouver system, also known as numeric referencing style or author-number system is a citation style that uses numbers within the text that refer to numbered entries in the reference list. It is popular in the physical sciences and is one of two referencing systems normally used in medicine.

However, all of these styles have the following features: author's name with surname written first, followed by the other name(s) and/or initials of the author, title of publication, edition statement (if any), and imprint. For an article in a journal publication, the following common features are found in all the reference style formats: author's surname followed by other names or initials, date (that is the year in which the journal was published), title of the article, title of journal, volume and part number (if any), and page number(s) of the article in the journal. For an article from an electronic source, the following common features are found in all the reference style formats: author(s), year, the title of the document (the type of medium, example email, blog), the organization responsible (optional). Retrieved from website address /Uniform Resource Locator (URL) or DOI (Digital Object Identifier) is required, while date article was accessed is not compulsory in some styles particularly in APA.

In other words, the reference citation and referencing or documentation styles or systems are essential tools in academic writings particularly in dissertations and theses from postgraduate students and other researchers. Various citation style formats abound and are adopted by different fields for specific purposes. However, the American Psychological Association (APA) and the Harvard system are the most commonly adopted citation methods in academic writings in the world. Regardless of the citation style format adopted, adherence to details and ensuring correctness, completeness, and consistencies by following the rules are the most important requirements.

ACCURACY, CONSISTENCY AND UNIFORMITY IN THE USE OF CITATION AND REFERENCING STYLES IN DOCTORAL THESES

In higher education, students at all levels are supposed to learn academic writing skills and to use and present cited materials in the text. The accuracy of referencing and avoiding plagiarism are highlighted in numerous writing manuals aimed towards higher education students. The writing manuals guide students in not only how to plan, write and organize a text but they also offer very detailed instructions on how to cite references (how to quote and use direct quotations of sources, how to paraphrase or summarize), and how to write a consistent reference list (Moore, 2014). The students are expected to write in a way that the reader knows exactly what part of the text is written by the author and what is cited from referenced sources. In-text citations and the reference list offer the reader a possibility to find further information and, in the context of education, a possibility to evaluate students' knowledge about the subject.

Masters (2005) puts it: "In academic writing, the need to quote and reference accurately is a given. To ensure accuracy, reference systems are designed in great detail ..." (p. 282). References are one of the main elements of research reports: they serve as a link between different types of information source and subject field (Powley & Dale, 2007); they enable readers to identify gaps in knowledge and increase their understanding of a given topic (Oermann & Ziolkowski, 2002); and they can be used to establish the originality of statements that are presented in scientific papers (Hagigi, 2002).

Consequently, every researcher must use references to validate their work. Incorrect or incomplete references are often found in lists of references, despite the emphasis that the editorial boards of reliable scientific journals place on the importance of referring to original sources and presenting these references correctly. Such errors break the link with the originally intended reference and lead to the transmission of incorrect information, which can result in confusion and a loss of trust among researchers. In addition, libraries and researchers have to pay high costs in terms of time and money to identify these references. To buttress this, a survey has shown that the average cost for the identification of a single reference by the staff of the US National Library of Medicine was 3.37 US dollars in 1980, and this amount had increased to 9.94 US dollars by 1996 (Powley & Dale, 2007).

Previous studies of the accuracy of references in the literature show that reference errors are common. These errors betray inattention to detail by the authors in this regard (Aronsky, Ransom, & Robinson, 2005). However, Accuracy of referencing in scientific writing has interested many researchers (Hausmann, McIntyre, Bumby, & Loubser, 2013; Siebers & Holt, 2000). Broadus (as cited in Harinarayana, Chikkamanju & Vasantha, 2011) investigated the validity of bibliographic citations. The study observed that the references found in journals were often lifted from other works without referring to the original articles. The study found that 23 percent of the citing papers misquoted the title of the cited articles.

Eichorn and Yankauer (as cited in Moore, 2014) found 31% of 150 randomly chosen references in public health journals to have citation errors in the author's name, the title of the article, volume, the year or page numbers. Aronsky, Ransom & Robinson (2005) determined the rate and the type of reference errors in the biomedical informatics journals. Of the 656 references examined, 225 (34.3%) references contained at least one error. Most of the errors occurred in the author element (39%) followed by journal title (31.2%), article title (17.7%), page number (7.4%), year (3.5%), and volume (1.3%). The study echoed the similar findings reported by Wilks and Spivey (2004) in which authors held the primary responsibility for maintaining the reference accuracy.

Assessment of In -Text Citations and Referencing Styles Adopted in Theses Submitted to University of Ilorin Postgraduate School between 2010 and 2016

Pritchard (2013) expressed concern for the quality of scientific articles offered to be published. From the editor's point of view, she has noticed a trend where "authors utilize sloppy and inconsistent citation practices, turning in manuscripts with badly formatted footnotes, missing or inaccurate author names, partial pagination", "concepts we thought were supposed to be learned at a far earlier stage in one's education" (p. 339). Similarly, Lamptey and Atta (2013) using a set of questionnaire and interviews on 506 Ghanaian postgraduate students discovered that they had problems with the citation of references in their academic work. There was inconsistency in citing references and the students adopted varying citation styles in their theses submitted to the same department.

These academic writing problems were due to students not fully understanding the reference style formats and the tendency to rely solely on books, lecturers or librarians for help to ensure accurate citations in their work. Kendall (2005) opined that students use of the online tutorial on citing and referencing has an impact on students' learning experiences in improving students' referencing skills. In view of the above, it should, however, be stated that the accuracy, consistency and uniformity of in-texts citations and references are essential to maintain the proper flow of information and the acknowledgement of published work in the scientific community, as well as to reduce document access charges.

METHODOLOGY

The design for this study is a citation analysis of the qualitative method, in which the Ph.D. theses submitted to the University of Ilorin Postgraduate School during the period 2010-2016 were examined. The study employed the method because it focused on gathering in-depth information from the theses so as to capture the in-text citations and referencing styles adopted in the theses. The 683 doctoral theses submitted to the Postgraduate School during the 6-year period, across 12 faculties and over 50 departments offering postgraduate programmes in the institution were selected. Pharmaceutical Sciences, Veterinary Medicine, and Environmental Sciences were the three faculties that did not meet this criterion and were therefore excluded from the study. The breakdown of the theses' spread across the faculties is as presented in Table 1.

Table 1

Study Population

S/N	Faculties	Study Population (No of Ph.D. Theses)
1	Agriculture	59
2	Arts	114
3	Basic Medical Sciences	21
4	Clinical Sciences	5
5	Communication and Information Sciences	20
6	Education	203
7	Engineering & Technology	27
8	Law	15
9	Life Sciences	42
10	Management Sciences	30
11	Physical Sciences	118
12	Social Sciences	29
Total		683

Source: University of Ilorin Postgraduate School Records

The sample for this study is 255 theses selected from the Ph.D. theses submitted covering the period, adopting purposive technique to select the theses across the faculties and departments to assess the in-text citations and referencing styles adopted. To select the sample size, Israel (2013) table was used and the distribution of the sample size is as presented in Table 2.

Table 2
Distribution of Sample Sizes for the Ph.D. Theses

S/N	Faculties	Study Population (No of Ph.D. Theses)	Sample Size
1	Agriculture	59	22
2	Arts	114	42
3	Basic Medical Sciences	21	8
4	Clinical Sciences	5	2
5	Communication and Information Sciences	20	7
6	Education	203	76
7	Engineering & Technology	27	10
8	Law	15	6
9	Life Sciences	42	16
10	Management Sciences	30	11
11	Physical Sciences	118	44
12	Social Sciences	29	11
Total		683	255

The document review, checklist, personal observation and interview were instruments for data collection. The document review is a way of collecting data by reviewing existing documents. The documents (Ph.D. theses) are accessible and domiciled in University of Ilorin Postgraduate School and cover mainly seven specified years. The Checklist contained standardized style rules for the text citations and reference lists guiding various referencing methods adopted in the selected theses. It was developed by the researchers, and aimed at examining the appropriateness of the in-text citations and referencing style formats adopted in doctoral theses. Observation was also used to collect data and in providing answers to the research questions.

Semi-structured interview was conducted to complement the examination of documents (Ph.D. theses) and the Checklist for data collection. It involved soliciting information from 20 Departmental Postgraduate Programme Coordinators (PGPC) through verbal interaction, using a prepared interview schedule. The selection of 20 PGPCs was purposive and cut across all the 12 faculties and over 50 departments offering Ph.D. programmes in the university. At least, one PGPC was interviewed in a faculty. The data collected were analyzed using qualitative content analysis for the in-text citations and referencing styles adopted in Ph.D. theses, while the text citations and reference list information were checked and compared for referencing styles, accuracy, consistency and uniformity, using the checklist and direct observation.

DATA ANALYSIS

The results from the analysis of the Ph.D. theses, and the interview are presented as follows:

RQ1. :How many doctoral theses are submitted to the University of Ilorin Postgraduate School according to the faculties and departments during the period 2010-2016?

Table 3

Distribution of the Theses' Spread across Faculties and Departments

S/N	Faculties	Departments	No of Ph.D. Theses	Total
1	Agriculture	Agricultural Economics & Management	10	59
		Agricultural Extension & Rural Dev.	19	
		Agronomy	8	
		Animal Production	15	
		Crop Protection	6	
		Home Economics & Food Science	–	
		Soil Science	1	
2	Arts	Arabic	25	114
		Center for Peace & Strategic Studies	8	
		English	13	
		French	8	
		History and Int'l Studies	11	
		Linguistics & Nigerian Languages	10	
		Performing Arts	8	
		Religions	31	
<i>Distribution of the Theses' Spread across Faculties and Departments</i>				
3	Basic Medical Sciences	Anatomy	14	21
		Medical Microbiology & Parasitology	1	
		Pharmacology & Therapeutics	–	
		Physiology	6	
4	Clinical Sciences	Epidemiology & Community Health	5	5
5	Communication & Info. Sciences	Computer Science	20	20
		Library & Info. Science	–	
6	Education	Arts Education	17	203
		Educational Mgt	34	

	Educational Technology	37	
	Guidance & Counselling	25	
	Health Promotion & Environmental Health	10	
	Human Kinetics Education	11	
	Science Education	37	
	Social Sciences Education	32	
7	Agricultural & Biosystems Engineering	7	27
	Engineering & Civil Engineering	13	
	Technology & Electrical & Electronics Engineering	5	
	Mechanical Engineering	2	
8	Common Law	9	15
	Law Islamic Law	6	

Distribution of the Theses' Spread across Faculties and Departments

9	Biochemistry	23	
	Life Sciences Microbiology	10	42
	Plant Biology	8	
	Zoology	1	
10	Accounting	8	
	Management Business Administration	17	30
	Sciences Finance	5	
11	Chemistry	19	118
	Physical Sciences Geology & Mineral Sciences	10	
	Industrial Chemistry	-	
	Mathematics	52	
	Physics	17	
	Statistics	20	
12	Economics	7	
	Social Sciences Geography	16	29
	Political Science	2	
	Sociology	4	
	Total	683	683

Source: University of Ilorin Postgraduate School Records

The data in Table 3 show the number of doctoral theses submitted to the Postgraduate School according to faculties and departments during the period. Of the 683 Ph.D. theses, the highest number (203) was submitted by the Faculty of Education. In all of eight departments offering doctoral programmes in the Faculty of Education, departments of Educational Technology and Science Education had the highest number (37), followed by Educational Management (34), Social Science department (32), and Health Promotion & Environmental Health with the least (10). Faculty of Physical Sciences had a total of 118, where Mathematics had the largest number (52) followed by Statistics (20),

Assessment of In -Text Citations and Referencing Styles Adopted in Theses Submitted to University of Ilorin Postgraduate School between 2010 and 2016

Chemistry (19), while Geology and Mineral Science with the lowest (10). With Arts having 111, while Agriculture had 59, Clinical Sciences is the faculty with the least number (5). Similarly, the Department of Mathematics had the highest number of theses (52), followed by the Departments of Educational Technology and Science Education (37), while the Department of Zoology, Faculty of Life Sciences had the lowest number of theses (1).

RQ 2 : What are the departmental, faculty and postgraduate school requirements for the submission of doctoral theses during this period?

The data show that in all the faculties and departments offering Ph.D. programmes, the presentation of papers and other reports at the seminars and theses form part of postgraduate doctoral students' mode of assessment. A candidate for the Ph.D. degree in a department is required to prepare and submit a thesis, which embodies his original research carried out substantially and independently during the period of his registration and making definite and greater contributions to the body of knowledge of the research area and scholarship. Moreover, the title of the thesis is required to be submitted through the Faculty Board to the Board of Postgraduate School for approval at least three months before the examination.

Furthermore, the thesis would be presented by the doctoral candidate and examined by a Panel of Examiners comprising an External Examiner, the Head of Department as Chairman, one other Internal Examiner selected from a related department in the University and Departmental PPC. Thereafter, the department would send a report of the outcome of the examination to the Postgraduate School not later than five working days after the Oral Examination. Where a thesis is referred, it must be submitted for the re-examination within one calendar year, and may only be re-submitted once. Where a Panel of Examiners recommends minor corrections to be effected in a thesis, subject to the satisfaction of the Internal Examiner, such corrections would be effected within three months.

After due processing, the Faculty would submit the Examiners' Report along with three hard-bound copies of the thesis, which must be in black colour with gold lettering to the Secretary of the Postgraduate School. Copies of the thesis so submitted would become the property of the University.

RQ 3: Which in-text citations and referencing styles adopted are predominant in the submitted theses during this period?

Table 4

Predominance of In-text Citations and Referencing Styles in the selected Theses

S/N	Faculties	In-text Citations	Referencing styles
1	Agriculture	APA	APA
2	Arts	APA, Harvard, MLA, Turabian & CSE	APA, Harvard, MLA, Turabian & CSE
3	Basic Medical Sciences	Vancouver	Vancouver
4	Clinical Sciences	Vancouver	Vancouver
5	Communication and Information Sciences	APA	APA
6	Education	APA	APA

7	Engineering & Technology	APA	APA
8	Law	UNILARS	UNILARS
9	Life Sciences	APA	APA
10	Management Sciences	APA & MLA	APA & MLA
11	Physical Sciences	APA, Harvard & CSE	APA, Harvard & CSE
12	Social Sciences	APA	APA

APA	-	American Psychological Association
CSE	-	Council of Science Editors
MLA	-	Modern Language Association
UNILARS	-	University of Ilorin Law Referencing Style

The results from Table 4 reveal that nearly all the faculties and departments adopted the APA reference citation format both in the in-text citations and references in the submitted theses. These are faculties of Agriculture, Communication and Information Sciences, Education, Engineering and Technology, Life Sciences and Social Sciences. Faculties that combined APA with other styles are Arts (Harvard, MLA, Turabian and CSE), Basic Medical Sciences, Management Sciences (MLA), and Physical Sciences (Harvard and CSE). Only Clinical Sciences and Law faculties adopted Vancouver and University of Ilorin Law Referencing Style (UNILARS - note and bibliography), respectively.

RQ 4 & 5: What is the level of accuracy and consistency in the use of in-text citations and referencing styles adopted in the submitted theses?

Table 5
Accuracy and Consistency of In-text Citations and Referencing Styles in the selected Theses

S/N	Faculties	No of selected Ph.D. Theses (Study Sample)	No of Accurate and consistent Ph.D. Theses
1	Agriculture	22	6
2	Arts	43	11
3	Basic Medical Sciences	8	4
4	Clinical Sciences	2	-
5	Communication and Information Sciences	7	2
6	Education	76	18
7	Engineering & Technology	10	3
8	Law	6	2
9	Life Sciences	16	5
10	Management Sciences	11	5
11	Physical Sciences	44	9
12	Social Sciences	11	4
Total		255	69

Assessment of In -Text Citations and Referencing Styles Adopted in Theses Submitted to University of Ilorin Postgraduate School between 2010 and 2016

The results in Table 5 showed that out of a total of 255 Ph.D. theses selected, 69 doctoral theses were found to be accurate regarding in-text citations and referencing styles adopted. The highest number of accurate Ph.D. theses (18) was submitted by the Faculty of Education, followed by Arts (11), Physical Sciences (9), and Agriculture (6) while those from Life Sciences and Management Sciences had 5 theses each, respectively. Other faculties followed in these orders: Faculties of Social Sciences and Basic Medical Sciences (4) theses each, Faculty of Engineering and Technology (3), Faculties of Communication and Information Sciences and Law (2) theses each.

RQ 6: What is the level of uniformity in the use of in-text citations and referencing style format adopted in the submitted theses?

Table 6

Level of uniformity in the use of In-text Citations and Referencing Styles in the selected Theses

S/N	Faculties	In-text Citations	Referencing style
1	Agriculture	APA	APA,
2	Arts	APA, Harvard, MLA, Turabian & CSE	APA, Harvard, MLA, Turabian & CSE
3	Basic Medical Sciences	APA & Vancouver	APA & Vancouver
4	Clinical Sciences	Vancouver	APA & Vancouver
5	Communication and Information Sciences	APA	APA
6	Education	APA	APA
7	Engineering and Technology	& APA	APA
8	Law	UNILARS	UNILARS
9	Life Sciences	APA	APA
10	Management Sciences	APA & MLA	APA & MLA
11	Physical Sciences	APA, Harvard & CSE	APA, Harvard & CSE
12	Social Sciences	APA	APA

Table 6 reveals the level of uniformity in the use of in-text citations and referencing styles adopted in the selected theses. The analysis showed that nearly all the faculties adopted the APA style in both the in-text citations and reference lists. All the departments in faculties such as Agriculture, Communication and Information Sciences, Education, Engineering and Technology, Life Sciences and Social Sciences adopted APA as their sole style. Other faculties that combined APA with other referencing styles are Arts (Harvard, MLA, Turabian and CSE), Basic Medical Sciences, Management Sciences (MLA), and Physical Sciences (Harvard and CSE). Only Clinical Sciences and Law adopted Vancouver and UNILARS) as referencing methods, respectively.

REPORT OF THE INTERVIEW WITH POSTGRADUATE PROGRAMME COORDINATORS

In order to obtain, complement and make for issues and facts not comprehensively covered by the examination of documents (Ph.D. theses) related to the study, interviews were conducted with Postgraduate Programme Coordinators (PPCs) in 20 selected departments offering Ph.D. programmes. This was with a view to getting first-hand and in-depth information on the standard referencing style format recommended for doctoral students, ascertaining the extent Ph.D. students adhere strictly to the recommended format, understanding the penalty for students who fail to adhere to the specified format, determining the measures taken by the department/faculty towards ensuring quality assurance in the reference style format, and ascertaining whether seminars or workshops are organized by the department/faculty to ensure compliance in the specified format.

The interview revealed that majority of the departments adopts American Psychological Association (APA) particularly the sixth edition, which is the latest edition. Moreso, departments of Basic Medical and Clinical Sciences use Vancouver, while Faculty of Law adopts University of Ilorin Law Referencing Style (UNILARS) (footnote and bibliography). UNILARS has been in existence since last 10 years, and it was fashioned after the OSCOLA referencing style used in Faculty of Law, University of Oxford. OSCOLA, as well as UNILARS, is a footnote style: all citations appear in footnotes and does not use endnotes or in-text citations. In longer works, such as books and theses, a bibliography listing secondary sources should be provided after the main body of text and any appendices. It should include all such sources cited in the work and need not to be indexed. These corroborate with the data presentation and analysis as shown in Table 4.2.

The preference for APA format is based on its universal acceptability and adoption practically in all institutions in the world because it is easy to learn and simple to use. Some PPCs argued that the adoption of APA style was based on the decision of the departments, while others believed that it was on the collaborative efforts between the faculties and departments based on the recommendations from the Postgraduate School. It was further revealed that the template for any citation style format adopted by any department is available online and students are meant to download and make use of it as advised by the supervisor. Alternatively, the doctoral students are asked to check the past theses submitted to the departments in order to acquaint him/her to the pattern of referencing style adopted in the department. This implies that no handbook or document as obtainable in some institutions is handed down to doctoral students to serve as guidelines in documenting their work at the University of Ilorin Postgraduate School except Faculty of Law who provides handbook to postgraduate students on how to cite and reference any source.

Furthermore, it was revealed by the interviewees i.e. 20 PPCs in selected departments that the Ph.D. students are expected to adhere strictly to the recommended format in writing their theses, and failure to do so; their theses would be rejected, and not be certified and they would be asked to rework it before the final submission by the supervisor. At the final submission, a Panel of Examiners which comprises an External Examiner, the Head of Department, one Internal Examiner selected from a related department in the University and PPCs would ensure that the corrections are effected before such theses are finally submitted to the Board of Postgraduate School for approval.

As parts of the measures taken to ensure quality assurance in the in-text citations and referencing styles used by the doctoral students, all the 20 interviewed PPCs in the 12 faculties agreed that departmental seminars are organized for Ph.D. students at the departmental level to ensure compliance with the adopted citation format. Thereafter, students would be made to make presentation of their work as seminar papers, reports of dissertations and theses at

several stages at the department, where corrections are suggested and effected before a Panel of Examiners is invited to screen the theses.

DISCUSSION OF THE FINDINGS

The findings of the study revealed that of the 683 theses submitted during the period covered, the highest number was from the Faculty of Education representing about one-third of all the submissions and the lowest from the Faculty of Clinical Sciences. Generally, the requirement for submission of doctoral theses at the University of Ilorin, is that a doctoral student should submit a thesis to reflect his original research carried out substantially and independently during the period of his registration and making definite and greater contributions to the body of knowledge of the research area and scholarship. This is line with the position of Drennan and Clarke (2009) that doctoral students should develop solid research skills such as the ability to work independently and critically, the ability to develop arguments, and awareness and use of advanced methodological designs that pertained to the student's discipline of study.

The finding also revealed that the theses were presented by the doctoral candidate and examined by a Panel of Examiners comprising an External Examiner, the Head of Department as Chairman, at least one supervisor, one other Internal/External Examiner selected from a related department in the university and the Coordinator. This agrees with the positions of Woolhouse (2002), Phillips and Pugh (2000), which stressed the need for supervisors to have a very clear understanding of students' expectations of the supervisory process from the outset and to provide explicit guidelines as to what the supervisor will and will not be able to provide.

The results of the analysis on the predominant in-text citations and referencing styles adopted in the submitted theses revealed that there was widespread recognition of the importance of providing in-text citations and references among the students, in spite of the wide variations in practices across the departments. Differences were clearly observed in the use of various citation formats (APA, Harvard, MLA, and Turabian/Chicago (footnote and bibliography; CSE and Vancouver) in both in-text citations and references. This finding is supported by Park (2010) who suggested that one solution to this challenge is to integrate key components of proper referencing skills in coursework, letting students know they will lose marks or grades if they do not cite properly.

However, the APA is the most predominantly used, followed by Harvard, MLA and Vancouver, being the specified referencing styles in some departments in such faculties as Arts, Basic Medical Sciences, Clinical Sciences, Management Sciences and Physical Sciences. These findings are corroborated by Hart (2005) who stated that the citations map the space of your discipline and allow you to navigate your way through your chosen field of study. Thus, the predominant use of APA format is due to its wide acceptance in the Social Sciences and all other fields such as Agriculture, Education, Business, Management, Nursing and other sciences related disciplines.

The level of accuracy in the use of in-text citations and referencing styles adopted in the submitted theses was examined. The findings showed that in the 69 theses examined, text citations and reference lists were accurate and generally followed the accepted norms of academic writing. This implied that majority of the theses were riddled with inaccuracies. These errors were found in authors' names which include misspellings, omitted names, inaccurate or omitted initials, and inaccurate author order. Other inaccuracies were found in the article title, book title, journal title, the title of book chapter which include misspellings, omitted words and omitted grammatical notations. Volume and issue number, year of publication, referrals to webpages instead of referring to the author, mistakes in alphabetical order, punctuation and capitalization. This agrees with the finding of Moore (2014) who reported that

referencing styles of 50 out of 91 theses were accurate. In other 186 theses, there were some inaccuracies in reference citations. The findings also corroborate with that of Lamptey and Atta (2013), which reported 341 reference errors in the 347 references in Ph.D. theses in Tabriz University of Medical Sciences and 348 errors in the 357 references in doctoral theses in Tehran University of Medical Sciences.

Meanwhile, it was discovered that there were a lot of improvements in the correctness and appropriateness in the use of referencing style both in the text citations and reference list in the Ph.D. thesis submitted since 2015. These were evident in the in-text citations and reference lists examined in the theses in such areas as authors' name, article title, book title, journal title, the title of a book chapter, volume and issue number, and publication year. Others included citations mentioned in-text, now included in the references, providing the readers with full reference information, and accurately stipulated punctuation and capitalization, where necessary. This finding was corroborated by Harinarayana et al (2011) who stressed the fact that accuracy is seen as precision and exactness in names of authors, publication name, year of publication and page numbers, both in the in-text citations and reference list.

The extent to which the adopted in-text citations and referencing styles are consistent with the submitted theses was ascertained. Consistency is the degree to which researchers conform or adhered strictly to the stated rules in the reference format used in the theses. The findings of the study revealed that 69 out of the 255 theses were consistent. These consistencies were noticed when the cited sources were found in the reference lists in the correct alphabetical order, and both text citations and reference lists provided relevant detailed information about the sources. This concurs with the findings of Moore (2014) who reported that the same referencing style was consistently used in both in-text citations and reference lists in electronically published theses.

This study's findings further indicated that the inconsistencies in 186 doctoral theses were observed in the presentation of publication date in different styles: after the authors' name, at the end of the reference, and either with or without the bracket. This could have been normal and acceptable if each was used with the suitable referencing format, but these were simultaneously used in the examined doctoral theses. Others included inconsistent use of "and" and/or ampersand (&) to separate the names of the author, incoherence in the use of et al (and others) both in-text citations and reference lists, punctuations' incompatibility that is using period (.) instead of comma (,), using semi-colon (;) instead of colon (:), and above all, used of different reference citation formats either in the in-text citations or references or both in their theses. The findings align with the reports of Lamptey and Atta (2013), which discovered that there were inconsistencies in citing references and the students adopted varying citation styles in their theses submitted to the repository of the same department. Also, Pritchard (2013) discovered that authors utilize sloppy and inconsistent citation practices.

The level of uniformity in the use of in-text citations and referencing style adopted in the submitted doctoral theses was examined. The findings revealed that there was lack of uniformity in the referencing styles adopted across the faculties and departments in the university. These findings agree with that of Lamptey and Atta (2013) which reported that postgraduate students in Kwame Nkrumah University of Science and Technology, Kumasi, Ghana used different citation styles in their theses.

CONCLUSION

Based on the findings, this study has established that there are wide-scale variations in the referencing styles adopted by doctoral students in the presentation of submitted Ph.D. theses; widespread violations of rules and regulations

Assessment of In -Text Citations and Referencing Styles Adopted in Theses Submitted to University of Ilorin Postgraduate School between 2010 and 2016

guiding the graphic representation of ideas, books, journals, essays and other materials consulted in the course of writing the theses as well as inconsistencies and lack of uniformity in the submitted theses.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Based on the findings and the conclusion drawn, the study recommends that:

1. The University of Ilorin Postgraduate School should come up with a University of Ilorin Manual of Style (UILMS) for writing theses and dissertations for higher degrees in order to address the problems caused by the non-existence of one presently, which had led to varieties in the styles being adopted now and their attendant inaccuracies.
2. The Postgraduate School should ensure that faculties and departments enforce its adoption by all postgraduate students in the submission of their dissertations and/or theses.
3. Submissions to the Postgraduate School by faculties and departments that failed to adopt strictly the styles in the manual should be returned back for full compliance so as to serve as deterrent to others.
4. The Postgraduate School should organize seminars and workshops for all the departmental PG Coordinators on the need to adopt the guidelines in the Manual by the postgraduate students as a condition for accepting submission of dissertations and theses.
5. Supervisors and advisors should pay attention to the process of writing of theses, in particular with respect to accuracy, correctness and precision of documentation methods. Also, the ability to pay attention to detail and follow instructions accurately and consistently should be particularly important for all postgraduate students.
6. Sensitization of the postgraduate students through seminars and workshops on the essence and strategic importance on how to cite references correctly and consistently during their first and second year should be given adequate consideration.

REFERENCES

- [1] Amadasu, M.E. (2010). Project management in Colleges of Education libraries in Edo and Delta States of Nigeria. *Journal of Research in Education and Society*, 1(2&3).
- [2] American Psychological Association (2003). *Five principles for research ethics*. Retrieved from <https://www.apa.org/ethics/code/principles.pdf>
- [3] American Psychological Association (6thed.) (2010). Retrieved from https://library.sydney.edu.au/subjects/downloads/.../APA%20Complete_2012.pdf
- [4] American Sociological Association (2010). Retrieved from <https://www.durhamtech.edu/dtcclibrary/ASAStyle.pdf>.
- [5] Andrews, R. (2007). Argumentation, critical thinking and the postgraduate dissertation. *Educational Review*, 59(1),1-18.
- [6] Anunobi, C. V., Okoye, I., & Chima, N. J. (2012). Citation analysis of postgraduate students as a measure of their resources preference. *International Journal of Social Science and Education*, 2(4), 646-656.
- [7] Anunobi, U. V. (2002). Citation behaviour of undergraduate and postgraduate students in the Federal University of Technology, Owerri: An issue for concern. *Nigerian Library and Information Science Trends*, 1(1), 18-27.

- [8] Armitage, A. (2006). The roles, expectations and experiences of master's degree dissertation supervisors. In C. Rust (Ed.), *Improving student learning through assessment. Proceedings of the 13th Improving Student Learning Symposium*. Imperial College, London, England: Oxford Brookes University.
- [9] Aronsky, D. A., Ransom, J., & Robinson, K. (2005). Accuracy of references in five biomedical informatics journals. *Journal of the American Medical Informatics Association*, 12, 587.
- [10] Bitchener, J., & Basturkmen, H. (2006). Perceptions of the difficulties of postgraduate thesis students writing the discussion section. *Journal of English for Academic Purposes*, 5(1), 4–18. Brighton, Australia: Christobel Engineering.
- [11] Borthakur, P. (2015). Citation analysis of theses and dissertations in Chemistry submitted to the LNB library, Dibrugarh University, 2009-2013. *International Journal of Research in Library Science (IJRLS)*, 1(2), 33-41.
- [12] Coleman, A. (2005). Instruments of cognition: Use of citations and web links to online teaching materials. *Journal of the American Society for Information Science and Technology*, 56(4), 382-392.
- [13] Council of Science Editors Style Guide (8th ed.) (2014). Retrieved from http://www.ucalgary.ca/ssc/files/ssc/wss_cse_2014.pdf
- [14] Damarell, R., Badcock, J., & Miller, R. (2005). *Author-date (Harvard) referencing guide* (3rd ed.) Adelaide: Flinders University, School of Nursing and Midwifery.
- [15] Devi, S. & Das, R. (2016). A citation analysis of the doctoral dissertations submitted to the Department of English, Gauhati University, India during 2009-2012. *Asian Journal of Multidisciplinary Studies*, 4(1), 132-138.
- [16] Echezona, R. I, Okafor, V. N., & Ukwoma, S. C. (2011). Information sources used by postgraduate students in library and information science: A citation analysis of dissertations. *Library Philosophy and Practice*. Retrieved from <http://unlib.unl.edu/LPP/>
- [17] Flinders University (2002). *Style manuals for authors, editors and primaries* (6th ed). Canberra: Smooks and Company.
- [18] Hagigi, M. (2002). The usage of the citation in scientific writings. *Journal of Education and Psychology*, 32, 215–232.
- [19] Harinarayana, N. S., Chikkamanju, & Vasantha, R. N. (2011). A study of citation accuracy in psychology theses submitted to the University of Mysore. *Annals of Library and Information Studies*, 58, 326–334.
- [20] Hart, C. (2005). *Doing your masters dissertation: Realizing your potential as a social scientist*. Retrieved from <http://www.amazon.com/Doing-Masters-Dissertation-Study-Skills/dp/0761942173>.
- [21] Harvard System of Referencing Guide (2010). Retrieved from <http://libweb.anglia.ac.uk/referencing/>
- [22] Haussmann, N. S., McIntyre, T., Bumby, A. J., & Loubser, M. J. (2013). Referencing practices in physical geography: How well do we cite what we write? *Progress in Physical Geography*, 37(4), 543–549.
- [23] Ifidon, S. E. (2006). *Modern theory and practice of library collection development*. Benin City: JusticeJeco Publishers

Assessment of In -Text Citations and Referencing Styles Adopted in Theses Submitted to University of Ilorin Postgraduate School between 2010 and 2016

- [24] Israel, G. D. (2013). Determining sample size. *Institute of Food and Agricultural Science*, University of Florida, PEOd-6, 1-5.
- [25] Kendall, M. (2005). Tackling student referencing errors through an online tutorial. *Aslib Proceedings: New Information Perspectives*, 57(2), 131-145. Retrieved from www.emeraldinsight.com/0001-253X.html
- [26] Komba, S. C. (2016). Challenges of writing theses and dissertations among postgraduate students in Tanzanian higher learning institutions. *International Journal of Research Studies in Education*, 5(3), 71-80.
- [27] Krummel, D. W. (2002). Bibliography. In J. R. Schement (Ed.), *Encyclopedia of Communication and Information* (pp. 75-76). New York, NY: Macmillan.
- [28] Lamptey, R. B., & Atta-Obeng, H. (2012). Challenges with reference citation among postgraduate students at the Kwame Nkrumah University of Science and Technology, Kumasi, Ghana. *Journal of Science and Technology*, 32(3), 68-80.
- [29] Lessing, A. C., & Schulze, S. (2003). Lecturers' experience of postgraduate supervision in a distance education context. *SAJHE/SATHO*, 17(2), 159-168.
- [30] Masters, K. (2005). Flawed evidence: A case study of misquoting and inaccurate referencing. *South African Journal of Libraries & Information Science*, 71(3), 282-288.
- [31] Modern Language Association (8th ed.) (2016). Retrieved from <https://owl.english.purdue.edu/owl/resource/747/22/>
- [32] Moore, E. (2014). Accuracy of referencing and patterns of plagiarism in electronically published theses. *International Journal of Educational Integrity*, 10(1), 42-55.
- [33] Mutula, S.M. (2009). Challenges of postgraduate research: Global context, African perspectives. *Key Note Address Delivered at the Zululand, 10th DLIs Annual Conference*. Retrieved from www.lis.uzulu.ac.za/2009/Mutula-UZ2009DLISPaper.pdf.
- [34] Neville, C. (2007). *The complete guide to referencing and avoiding plagiarism*. Retrieved from <http://www.infolib.vnua.edu.vn/.../Neville,%20Colin.%20The%20Complete%20Guide%20to20>
- [35] Oermann, M. H., & Ziolkowski, L. D. (2002). Accuracy of references in three critical care nursing journals. *Journal of Perianesthesia Nursing*, 17, 78-83.
- [36] Olatokun, W.M., & Makinde, O. (2009). Citation analysis of doctoral works submitted to the Department of Animal Science, University of Ibadan, Nigeria. *Library Philosophy and Practice*, 1-15.
- [37] Park, S., Lori, A. M., & Connie, J. U. (2010). I've lost my identity – oh, there it is . . . in a style manual teaching citation styles and academic honesty. *Reference Services Review*, 39(1), 42-57. Retrieved from www.emeraldinsight.com/0090-7324.html

- [38] Postgraduate Research (2009). *Wikipedia [Online]*. Retrieved from http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Postgraduate_research
- [39] Powley, B., & Dale, R. (Eds).(2007). *Evidence-based information extraction for high accuracy citation and author name identification*. RIAO Large-Scale Semantic Access to Content Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania: Robert Dale's Publications.
- [40] Pritchard, S. M. (2013). The rising rate of plagiarism, careless citation practice, bad grammar, and failure to read (and I'm not talking about the students). *Libraries & the Academy*, 13(4), 339-341
- [41] Siebers, R., & Holt, S. (2000). Accuracy of references in five leading medical journals. *The Lancet*, 356 (9239), 1445.
- [42] Singh, M. K. M. (2015). International graduate students' academic writing practices in Malaysia: Challenges and solutions. *Journal of International Students*,5(1), 12-22. Retrieved from <http://www.jistudents.org/>
- [43] Singh, K. P., & Bebi (2013). Citation analysis of Ph. D. theses in Sociology submitted to university of Delhi during 1995-2010. *DESIDOC Journal of Library and Information Technology*, 33(6), 489-493.
- [44] Somashekara, Y. L., & Kumbar, M. (2015). Citation analysis of doctoral theses: An analysis of Physics submitted to three universities of Karnataka, India. *International Journal of Library and Information Studies*, 5(1), 20-33.
- [45] Swain, D.K. (2010).Global adoption of electronic theses and dissertations. *Library Philosophy and Practice*. Retrieved from <http://www.webpages.unidaho.edu/~mbolin/dillip~swam.pdf>
- [46] Ticinch, D.J. (2006).*Key factors in postgraduate research: A guide for students*.
- [47] Turabian, K. L. A. (2010). Manual for writers of research papers, theses, and dissertations(16th ed.). Retrieved from <http://press.uchicago.edu/ucp/books/book/chicago/M/bo14821662.html> and http://www.chicagomanualofstyle.org/tools_citationguide.html
- [48] Vancouver Referencing Guide (2011). Retrieved from <http://www.ucd.ie/t4cms/Guide72pdf> and <http://www.imperial.ac.uk/media/imperial-college/administration-and-support-services/library/public/vancouver.pdf>
- [49] Wang, T., & Li, L.Y. (2008).Understanding international postgraduate research students' challenges and pedagogical needs in thesis writing. *International Journal of Pedagogies and Learning*, 4(3), 88-96. Retrieved from <http://dx.doi.org/10.5172/ijpl.4.3.88>
- [50] Wilks, S. E., & Spivey, C. A. (2004). Views of reference list accuracy from social journal. *Archives in Social Work*, 5(2), 172-181.
- [51] Yusuf, F. L. (2016). Citation analysis of Master's dissertations of library and information sciences department (Unpublished master's dissertation). Bayero University, Kano.